



APPROVED
SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2015

**COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:05 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Jyme Sue McLaren, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

STAFF: Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner
Frances Cookson, Staff Representative

GUESTS: John McEnroe

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

4. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – November 19, 2015
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – November 19, 2015
- Special Meeting of the Transportation Commission – December 3, 2015

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY MOVED TO APPROVE THE STUDY SESSION MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 19, 2015, THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 19, 2015 AND THE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES OF DECEMBER 3, 2015. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

5. BICYCLE FRIENDLY COMMUNITY

Susan Conklu, Senior Transportation Planner, provided the report. Highlights included:

- The League of American Bicyclists (LAB) is a national award program recognizing communities that actively support cycling for transportation and recreation. It provides cities with measureable goals for improvement in the areas of engineering, education, encouragement, events, enforcement, evaluation and planning.
- Communities are eligible for several awards, with diamond level being the highest, followed in descending order by platinum, gold, silver, bronze and honorable mention.
- Scottsdale was awarded silver level in 2005 and 2007. LAB has since revised its review schedule to every four years. Scottsdale was awarded gold level in 2011.
- Public workshops were held in June with bicyclists providing feedback and suggestions. In July, the results were presented to the Paths & Trails Subcommittee and the Transportation Commission. In August, the finalized application for award was submitted to LAB. On November 16th, LAB made national award announcements with Scottsdale renewing their gold status. Tempe was upgraded to gold and Mesa was upgraded to silver. The process included a report card which provided feedback and suggestions for obtaining platinum status.
- Areas identified for improvement to platinum level include:
 - Increase bike lanes on arterial and collector streets from the current 30 percent rate up to 78 percent.
 - Increase public outreach events, including open streets events.
 - Improvement in the overall bike network and addition of different types of bike facilities.
 - Installation of a bicycle wayfinding system showing distances.
 - Increase the amount of bike parking throughout the community.
 - Launch of a public bike share system.
 - Increase number of adult bicycle education classes.
 - Work with community groups to expand the Safe Rides to School Program.
 - Increased efforts to promote bike to work and bike to school day.
 - Ensure that police officers are educated on traffic laws in relation to bicyclists.
 - Consider updating ordinances which currently prohibit motorized bicycles on paths.
 - Continue to update the Transportation Master Plan to develop needed infrastructure.
 - Develop goals for bicycle miles travelled for work, shopping, school and exercise and address any barriers to ridership.

- Next steps include:
 - Continue evaluation and planning of strategies for key step implementation.
 - Reapply for award in the summer of 2019.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley addressed the issue of connectivity with adjacent communities and noted that Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) does not place particular importance on this. Ms. Conklu clarified that MAG does stress the importance of regional connectivity, which helps the City in terms of application of grants through MAG programs.
- A Commissioner asked about the effect of awards from LAB on property values. Ms. Conklu confirmed that studies have shown that property values are positively affected in neighborhoods that are considered walkable and bikable.
- In response to a question from a Commissioner, Ms. Conklu acknowledged that while education efforts have included elementary schools, these have not yet expanded to middle schools and high schools.
- A Commissioner asked about the relationship between the bike share program and bike rental businesses. Ms. Conklu replied that bike share systems are meant to accommodate quick, perhaps one-way trips, while rentals are designed for longer interval needs.
- A Commissioner noted that the LAB report card is very informative for the Paths & Trails Subcommittee as well as the Transportation Department. He added that the rental program should include adult tricycles and suggested that data be collected to track age ranges related to ridership as well as key outcomes. Chair Olmsted concurred with the suggestion to include adult tricycles.
- Vice Chair Holley asked that an update be given in one year on efforts to achieve platinum status.
- Ms. Conklu stated that the next Paths & Trails Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for January 12, 2016.
- Chair Olmsted stressed support for the all modes transportation model going into 2016.

6. NATURAL AND BUILT ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY REPORT

Chair Olmsted discussed the origins of the report, which arose from the City of Scottsdale report to citizens and resulting opportunities to address items that might not be reflected in the new draft proposal of the Transportation Master Plan.

Mr. Basha stated that sustainable transportation systems include safety, access, human and ecosystem help, equity within and between generations. A Commissioner requested that maintenance be added as a key component within the context of sustainable transportation.

Chair Olmsted stated that approximately a year ago, the Federal Highway Department developed an online tool that addresses planning, design, construction, operations and maintenance. The intent was to begin a dialogue on sustainability and incrementally build on this in 2016. He suggested that the issue of lifecycle considerations would be one of the initial subjects for discussion.

A Commissioner commented that affordability should also include consideration of reliable funding sources as an issue of sustainability.

Mr. Basha provided a list of example projects completed in the past year, which are pertinent to the topic of sustainability, noting that one definition of sustainability is efficiency of operation. Traffic congestion causes air pollution and excessive wear and tear on vehicles and streets. The Northsight extension project, completed a year and a half ago, features a roundabout, which resulted in a 50 percent decrease in travel time at the roundabout location. A continued portion of the route has been reduced in travel time by one-third. In addition, due to resulting reduced traffic signal time, traveling on Frank Lloyd Wright Boulevard farther on the route has decreased by one-third.

A crash comparison analysis of pre-project completion and post-project completion reveals that the number of crashes has remained the same, with traffic volumes increased substantially, related to driver interest in use of roundabouts. The number of injuries pre-completion was over three and post-completion is less than one. The number of injuries dropped to 0.05 injuries per million vehicle miles traveled.

Chair Olmsted suggested that the Department add level of service and systems performance to areas for analysis and reporting in 2016.

A Commissioner commented that there are many aspects related to sustainability that have not been addressed, such as fuel efficiency, air quality for citizen and the aesthetic quality from a reduction of clutter. He suggested that aesthetics be added to list of items for reporting in 2016.

Mr. Basha addressed the Arizona Canal multiuse path, a two mile segment extending from Chaparral Road to Indian Bend Wash and soon to be constructed. The project took five years of planning before approval, largely due to neighborhood opposition. This opposition added two years to the overall planning time. A large segment of the community is opposed to the construction of multiuse paths, which results in significant delays for these projects.

Mr. Basha discussed the City's hybrid fuel trolleys. There has been consideration for the purchase of battery operated buses, including a visit to the manufacturing facility in Southern California. It was determined that the manufacturer was not prepared to provide a large number of battery powered vehicles at this time, however it is anticipated that the Department will come before the Commission in 2016 with a recommendation to purchase some such trolleys.

The Mustang Transit Center is in development, despite minimal opposition. The project has changed character dramatically over the last several years. It is hoped that construction will begin in the summer of 2016. The project would include a multi-lane roundabout and bus pullouts.

In response to a question from a Commissioner regarding bus routes, the existing Hayden Road Bus Route 81 would come through the area. Other expected routes are Shea Boulevard and the new Cactus trolley and a possible express bus route.

VICE CHAIR HOLLEY RECOMMENDED THAT A SUSTAINABILITY REPORT BE PRESENTED IN THE FALL OF 2016.

Mr. Basha stated that there were two additional topics for discussion under sustainability, however Chair Olmsted indicated that due to time constraints, those would be tabled for a future meeting.

COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED.

A Commissioner commented about the northbound traffic on 90th Street and asked about impacts at Shea Boulevard resulting from the roundabout. Mr. Basha replied that this will remain a highly congested intersection. The only way to reduce congestion is to widen Shea Boulevard to five lanes per direction, which is likely impossible.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER GRAHAM STEPPED AWAY.

7. DOWNTOWN CONSULTANT PARKING STUDY

Paul Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- The Department contracted with an outside consultant to analyze the parking situation in the downtown area with a primary focus on the northeast quadrant, north of Indian School Road and east of Scottsdale Road.
- The purpose of the study was to collect data, provide analysis and provide suggestions based on successful approaches by other communities in similar parking situations. The study was not designed to result in direct recommendations.
- There are approximately 18,000 parking spaces throughout downtown, half being public and half being private.
- One of the disputed conclusions of the study is that there is not much of a parking problem in downtown Scottsdale, however, many of the spaces are poorly situated.

Chair Olmsted asked whether the consultant could provide potential solutions, if requested to do so. Mr. Basha referred to the page in the report that lists all potential solutions and identifies them as either solutions that are inappropriate for Scottsdale, solutions being considered by Scottsdale, or solutions that should be considered.

- A number of downtown properties have a reduced parking requirement. In the 1970s and 1980s, many parking spaces on the public streets in the vicinity were completely unused. Development was stifled, as property owners were unable to reconstruct or expand existing office buildings, because there was not enough space to build both buildings and parking areas. The community approached the City Council in the early 1980s and requested that the parking requirement be reduced. The request was granted, reducing parking capacity by up to two-thirds.
- A critical portion of the data analysis addressed parking occupancy by time of day. At 6:00 a.m., most parking areas are open. Low availability of parking spaces occurs between 10:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m. before capacity opens up again. There remain areas of low availability in on-street areas after 4:00 p.m.
- For more than eight hours, the on-street parking space east of the Galleria are over 80 percent occupied.
- For on-street parking south of the Galleria from before 10:00 a.m. to after 12:00 noon, parking is occupied over 80 percent. From July of 2011 through September of this

year, most parking spaces on public streets in the area are restricted to three-hour use, resulting in parking citations. Nearly 800 tickets are issued per month.

- Three-hour parking limits have worked well in other parts of the downtown, primarily in retail and restaurant areas.
- Potential solutions include a parking structure at a cost of six to ten million dollars, providing 400 to 1,200 spaces. The Department is exploring a number of public and private financial arrangements to provide the structure. The cost per space varies dramatically from \$6 million for 400 spaces in city-owned property to \$10 million for 1,200 hundred spaces, requiring the purchase of private property.
- Another potential solution is to increase parking requirements. While the option should be explored, it is not recommended.
- There is a P3 zoning district east and south of the Galleria, which was created 30 years ago and requires the City to provide parking spaces for private businesses. Theoretically, the zoning ordinance could be changed to remove the decrease in parking requirement. However, this is also seen as an unlikely solution and would disincentivize reconstruction and new construction of offices in this portion of Scottsdale.
- Short-term solutions include two hour parking, instead of three hours, and the restriping of an existing parking area. The parking area includes standing lights throughout the parking lot, which would have to be relocated in order to accommodate restriping. This modification would cost approximately \$10,000 and could be undertaken without Commission approval.
- Another concept would be to increase transit that serves this portion of Downtown Scottsdale. Currently Route 72 at Scottsdale Road runs every 20 minutes. In April, it will operate every ten minutes. It is conceivable to increase the frequency to every six minutes, including service to Scottsdale Fashion square to at least the Rural University light rail station. The change in frequency would cost approximately \$700,000. It is uncertain whether the increased frequency would dramatically decrease parking demand.
- The downtown trolley, which now begins at 11:00 a.m. and operates at ten minute frequency until 9:00 in the evening seven days a week does not serve offices before 11:00 a.m. It is a possibility that operations could begin six hours earlier, which would accommodate employees of various office buildings. It would also provide transportation from the mostly empty parking areas in the southwest and southeast portions of downtown to the employment centers in the northeast portion of downtown. Ten-minute service is likely to reduce parking deficiencies. This would not require the purchase of any vehicles and would cost approximately \$200,000 annually. This is expected to be one of the recommendations to City Council.
- An additional possibility is the installation of parking meters in on-street parking locations. Scottsdale removed its parking meters in the early 1980s. It is contemplated that on-street parking will remain free while parking structure spaces would require payment.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- A Commissioner asked about the possibility of the formation of an improvement district, which affected business would subsidize. Mr. Basha confirmed that this is one option. He added that improvement districts take approximately seven years from formation to construction. Conversations with downtown businesses have revealed that they would not be interested in taxing themselves to pay for a parking structure. Other possibilities include private operation and ownership, including hiring a parking

management company to construct the structure at their expense and recover expenses through parking charges.

- A Commissioner commented that the deficiency of downtown parking is an emergency situation and that the consultant company seems out of touch with the needs of the City. Mr. Basha replied that the consultant is an exceptionally good, world-renowned consultant. He added that City of Scottsdale behavior differs from the rest of the country. The Commissioner stated that he was angry at the existence of hidden, tax-funded public parking spaces within the City. Mr. Basha agreed that there are a small number of publicly funded but unusable spaces. Most spaces could be used and are obvious. The Commissioner noted that one of the potential recommendations in the report is to provide signs and maps to identify available parking and that even a five percent increase in use would be helpful. He also voiced approval for restriping the Stetson parking lot to increase capacity.
- In response to a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that the additional parking levels to the Galleria structure are private. Within the overall structure 100 spaces, although constructed by a private developer, must be available for public use.
- A Commissioner suggested the exploration of technology options for parking management.
- Chairman Olmsted reviewed the recommendations, including:
 - Expanding awareness of public parking applications.
 - Review City parking guidelines and identify restrictions to finding solutions.
 - Encourage education.
 - Conduct walking assessments, particularly in areas that are not overly accessible, known, or pleasant to park in.
 - Consider a downtown parking permit program.
 - Incentivize trolley riders with offsite opportunities within the City.
 - Revise the schedule for submission of solutions to the Commission to be as soon as possible.

8. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Paul Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- A new Policy Number 1 has been added, which states that travel routes and mode choice must be maximized.
- Policy Number 2 requires that the Plan must provide for complete streets.
- A policy from 2008 has been eliminated, which had required that 33 percent of transportation funds be used for non-private automobile travel.

Vice Chair Holley noted the absence of the policy related to Shea Boulevard, which Mr. Basha acknowledged was inadvertently omitted, but will be in the final version, unless directed to do otherwise by the Commission.

- Policy Number 3 has been added, referred to as a roundabouts first policy. As a result of analysis and data collection of the Hayden Northsight roundabout and the analysis accomplished by a consultant planning and designing the Raintree Drive extension, the Department believes it has clear evidence that roundabouts are far superior to traffic signals. The Department believes that a policy should be included to state that they begin with the assumption that a roundabout will be installed at a specific location. If for some reason, a signal is deemed to be preferred, this will require proof.

- Policy Number 4 states that traffic signals can only be installed through a specific analysis procedure. In addition, the Transportation Director must approve the proposed signal installation.
- Policy Number 5 has been modified to continue the biennial preparation of a traffic volume and collision rate report. However, it should be stated that this report should be used to prevent or reduce collisions.

Vice Chair Holley suggested that the Plan include a narrative that explains its purpose and how it ties into the General Plan.

- Policy Numbers 6 and 7 remain the same and include a requirement for speed limit studies every seven years.
- Policy 8 remains the same.

In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that there is a City requirement of one percent public art funding in every City-funded project. A Commissioner commented that aesthetic and sustainable statements be included in the Plan. A Commissioner suggested incorporation of a policy reference that would recognize the continued importance of the established ordinance that recognizes investment in public art for infrastructure capital.

- The Shea Boulevard policy remains essentially the same. It was originally adopted 20 years ago and the Department believes it is important for the community and should remain in the Plan.
- At the Commission's direction, the Department has included lane numbers and physical appearance of the streets in the Plan.
- Five street segments have been designated as one lane arterials. They include one 12 foot motor vehicle lane and one eight foot bicycle lane per direction. This provides 20 feet total width and accommodates emergency vehicles.

A Commissioner sought clarification pertaining the rural areas, where sidewalks are not provided and whether there are legacy trails that address accessibility. Mr. Basha clarified that multiuse paths are separate from streets and multiuse paths are often provided adjacent to streets in rural areas. This is not part of a street cross-section necessarily, as it varies from location to location.

- For proposed street elements, the one lane arterials would include Dynamite Boulevard, a segment of Pima Road, a portion of 128th Street, a portion of Ranch Gate Road and portion of Jomax Road.
- A collector street through the Preserve at 128th Street existed in the 2008 Transportation Master Plan. It has been recommended for elimination. The topic was presented to the McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission, which supported elimination. In its place, there will be an emergency access that will be 12 feet of payment and four feet of shoulder on either side.
- Proposed transit routes include identification of currently unserved or underserved portions of the City. With the new trolley routes, the Department is serving all but one of the currently unserved areas.
- There are five suggested alignments for the potential rail routes. The Department favors one of the McDowell Road routes, as there is a critical need to connect Scottsdale to Sky Harbor Airport.

- Light rail is designed for commuters, with relatively fast travel times. Stations are sparse and widely separated. Modern streetcars are not designed for commuters. Spacing between stations is quite short. Travel times are quite long and travel speeds are low.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley asked about Drinkwater as a possible alignment, rather than Goldwater. Mr. Basha agreed with the suggestion, noting that Drinkwater Boulevard includes Honor Health Care, the City Campus and would include the baseball stadium.
- Vice Chair Holley questioned support for 68th Street as an alignment. Mr. Basha replied that it was included for being analogous to the City of Tempe modern streetcar route that hopefully will be constructed and in operation by 2017. The route connects Scottsdale Fashion Square to residential communities between Scottsdale Road and 64th Street. It would provide connection to five different east/west bus routes. There has been commentary that Scottsdale Road is not appropriate for light rail, so an alternative alignment has been offered. Vice Chair Holley stressed the need for a narrative on how to approach evaluating alternatives during a screening process.
- A Commissioner suggested that the map be redrawn to illustrate the intent to have connection east/west and north/south to a regional system without indication of specific streets proposed for routes. Mr. Basha replied that this approach was considered, however it was determined that given the City's maturity, specific streets should be indicated, rather than generalized corridors.
- A Commissioner referred to the year 2040 referenced in the Plan and suggested the words "potential," or "future," be substituted.
- A Commissioner suggested removal of the term "light rail," and replacing it with "rail."
- A Commissioner suggested that the blue route should be "elbowed" up Scottsdale Road, rather than continuing it along McDowell Road.
- A Commissioner commented that many of the proposed routes require cooperation from a neighboring city.
- A Commissioner recommended that the Plan's statement to consider rail as an alternative be placed on the first page of the Plan.
- John McEnroe requested to speak as a representative of the McDowell Sonoran Conservancy Board of Directors. The Conservancy is a not-for-profit organization with more than 500 volunteers who have worked for 25 years to establish, protect and maintain the McDowell Sonoran Preserve. They champion the sustainability of the Preserve and connection to the community through safe, respectful access. The Conservancy supports the Department's proposed changes to the Transportation Master Plan that relate to the central region of the McDowell Sonoran Preserve. It supports the proposed re-designation of the section of 128th Street that crosses the Preserve from a minor collector to an emergency access road, as well as the reduction in the number of lanes from three to one on either side of Dynamite and Rio Verde Road east of 118th Street, where Dynamite and Rio Verde Road divides the north and south sections of the Preserve.
- Mr. Basha stated that a vote on the Plan is tentatively scheduled for January 21st, however suggested changes to the rail route may delay the vote.
- Chair Olmsted indicated that the following areas should be addressed: Shea Boulevard plan, general plan connectivity narrative, add appendices summary of complete streets and aesthetics, removal of the 2040 date and the term "light rail."

- Chair Olmsted added that high capacity transit should be agendized for January and that a February date be added for the Transportation Master Plan.
- In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stated that the General Plan is complete in preparation but has not yet been voted on by the City Council.
- Chair Olmsted proposed a speaker series to address aspects of the all modes transportation approach, as well as an all modes transportation summary in spring of 2016.
- Chair Olmsted referred to the MAG meeting minutes from November, which included a report that Phoenix Metro Area has been ranked by the Waze traffic app as the best driving experience in the world.

9. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Paul Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- Three missing sidewalk segments have recently been constructed throughout the community, including:
 - Indian Bend Road from Hayden Road to 84th Street on the north side.
 - Westland Drive in the far north part of the City just south of Carefree from 84th Street to 85th Street.
 - Legend Trail on an east side segment.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

11. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Chair Olmsted reviewed that the following items should be placed on upcoming agendas:
 - High capacity transit
 - Transportation Master Plan
 - Scheduling the first guest speaker, Don Couvillion.
- A Commissioner asked for an update on the regional paratransit study.

12. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the regular meeting at 9:30 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**